Court of Common Pleas of Philadelphia County Trial Division

Civil Cover Sheet

For Prothonotary Use Only (Docket Number)

AUGUST 2012

000300

PLAINTIFF'S NAME	E-Filling Number: 1208011156
GEORGE HARTWELL	DEFENDANTS NAME BARNABY'S WEST CHESTER, INC., ALIAS: BARNABY'S OF AMERICA
PLAINTIFF'S ADDRESS	DEFENDANTS ADDRESS
	CLI ENDANT'S ADDRESS
PLAINTIFF'S NAME	
ERMA HARTWELL	DEFENDANTS NAME ANDREW J. DONAGHY
PLAINTIFF'S ADDRESS	
	DEFENDANTS ADDRESS
PLAINTIFF'S NAME	
	DEFENDANTS NAME RONALD DUNN
PLAINTIFF'S ADDRESS	DESCRIPTION AND ADDRESS OF THE PROPERTY OF THE
	DEFENDANT'S ADDRESS
TOTAL NUMBER OF PLAINTIFFS TOTAL NUMBER OF DEFENDANTS	
2 3	COMMENCEMENT OF ACTION Complaint Petition Action Notice of Appeal
AMOUNT IN CONTROVERSY COURT PROGRAMS	☐ Writ of Summons ☐ Transfer From Other Jurisdictions
\$50,000.00 of less	ass Tort Commerce Settlement Wings Action Minor Court Appeal
More than \$50,000.00 Non-Jury	Williors
U Other:	Statutory Appeals W/D/Survival
CASE TYPE AND CODE	
2V - MOTOR VEHICLE ACCIDENT	
STATUTORY BASIS FOR CAUSE OF ACTION	THE STORES
RELATED PENDING CASES (LIST BY CASE CAPTION AND DOCKET NUMBER)	FILED IS CASE SUBJECT TO
	PRO PROTHY COORDINATION ORDER? YES NO
	AUG 07 2012
	S. GARRETT
TO THE PROTHONOTARY:	
Kindly enter my appearance on behalf of Plaintiff/Petitioner/	Appellant: GEORGE HARTWELL FRMA HARTWELL
Papers may be served at the address set forth below.	ippenant. Server HARTWELL
NAME OF PLAINTIFF'S/PETITIONER'S/APPELLANT'S ATTORNEY	ADDRESS
JOHN N. ZERVANOS	NONESS
PHONE NUMBER FAX NUMBER	
SUPREME COURT IDENTIFICATION NO.	
49615	E-MAIL ADDRESS
IGNATURE OF FILING ATTORNEY OR PARTY	DATE SUBMITTED
JOHN ZERVANOS	
	Tuesday, August 07, 2012, 03:02 pm

Supreme Count of Reni		Extract and stores of the		works and a second
Court of Common Pleas Civil Cover Sheet Philadelphia County		For Prothonotary Use Only: Docket No:		
Commencement of Action: Complaint	_	Petition Declaration of Taking		Talail V
Lead Plaintiff's Name: George Hartwell		Lead Defendant's Nar Barnaby's West (d/b/a Barnaby's of Americ
Are money damages requested?	⊠ Yes □ No	Dollar Amount R (check one		within arbitration limits outside arbitration limits
Is this a Class Action Suit?	☐ Yes ⊠ No	Is this an MD	J Appeal?	☐ Yes ☒ No
Nature of the Case: Place an "X"	to the left of the ONI	(are a Self-Represent	nost accurate	ely describes your
PRIMARY	ASE. If you are maki most important.	ing more than one ty	pe of claim,	check the one that
TORT (do not include Mass Tort) Intentional Malicious Prosecution Motor Vehicle Nuisance	CONTRACT (do n			rative Agencies
Premises Liability Product Liability (does not include mass tort) Slander/Libel/ Defamation Other:	Employment D Discrimination Employment D	n: Other Dispute:	Board Dept.	
Premises Liability Product Liability (does not include mass tort) Slander/Libel/ Defamation	Employment D	n: Other Dispute:	Board Dept. Statu	d of Elections of Transportation tory Appeal: Other

SOLOFF & ZERVANOS, P.C.

BY: John N. Zervanos, Esquire

Attorney I.D. # 49615

BY: Jeffrey P. Fritz, Esquire

Attorney I.D. #78124

Philadelphia, PA 19102

George Hartwell

Erma Hartwell, Individually and as Co-Administrators of The Estate of

Zachary D. Hartwell

Plaintiffs

V.

Barnaby's West Chester, Inc., d/b/a

Barnaby's of America

West Chester, PA 19382

and

Andrew J. Donaghy

and

Ronald Dunn, Co-Administrators of The Estate of Ryan M. Dunn

Defendants

Attorney for Plaintiff(s)

COURT OF COMMON PLEAS OF PHILADELPHIA COUNTY

TERM, 2012

NO.

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

NOTICE TO PLEAD

"NOTICE

"You have been sued. If you wish to defend against the claims set forth in the following pages, you must take action within twenty (20) days after this complaint and notice are served, by entering a written appearance personally or by attorney and filing in writing with the court your defenses or objections to the claims set forth against you. You are warned that if you fail to do so the case may proceed without you and a judgment may be entered against you by the court without further notice for any money claimed in the complaint or for any other claim or relief requested by the plaintiff. You may lose money or property or other rights important to you.

"YOU SHOULD TAKE THIS PAPER TO YOUR LAWYER AT ONCE. IF YOU DO NOT HAVE A LAWYER OR CANNOT AFFORD ONE, GO TO OR TELEPHONE THE OFFICE SET FORTH BELOW ITO FIND OUT WHERE YOU CAN GET LEGAL HELP]. THIS OFFICE CAN PROVIDE YOU WITH INFORMATION ABOUT HIRING A LAWYER.

IF YOU CANNOT AFFORD TO HIRE A LAWYER, THIS OFFICE MAY BE ABLE TO PROVIDE YOU WITH INFORMATION ABOUT AGENCIES THAT MAY OFFER LEGAL SERVICES TO ELIGIBLE PERSONS AT A REDUCED FEE OR NO FEE,

LAWYER REFERRAL SERVICE One Reading Center 1101 Market Street Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19107 (215) 238-6333 "AVISO"

"Le han demandado a usted en la corte. Si usted desea defender contra la demandas dispuestas en las pagina siguentes, usted debe tomar la accion en el plazo de viente (20) diás despues de esta queja y se sirve el aviso, incorporando un aspecto escrito personalmente o y archivando en escribir con la corte sus defensas u objeciones a las demandas dispuestas contra usted el abogado le advierte que si usted no puede hacer asi que el case puede proceder sin usted y un juicio se puede incorporar contra usted contra la corte sin aviso adicional para cualquier dinero demandado en la queja or para cualquier otra demanda or relevacion pedida por el demandante. Usted puede perder el dinero o la caracteristica de otra endereza importante a usted.

"USTED DEBE LLEVAR ESTE PAPEL SU ABOGADO INMEDIATAMENTE. SI USTED NO HACE QUE UN ABOGADO VAYA A O LLAME POR TELEFONO LA OFICINA DISPUESTA ABAJO. ESTA OFICINA PUEDE PROVEER DE USTED LA INFORMATION SOBRE EMPLEAR A UN ABOGADO, SI USTED NO PUEDE OBTENER O PAGAR LOS SERVICIOS DE UN ABOGADO, ESTA OFICINA QUIZAS PUEDA PROVEERLE A USTED INFORMACION SOBRE LAS AGENCIAS QUE OFREZCAN SERVICIOS JURIDICOS A LAS PERSONAS ELEGIBLE EN UN HONORARIO REDUCIDO O NINGUN HONORARIO.

SERVICIO DE REFERENCIA LEGAL One Reading Center 1101 Market Street Filadelfia, Pennsylvania 19107 Telefono: (215) 238-6333

SOLOFF & ZERVANOS, P.C.

BY: John N. Zervanos, Esquire

Attorney I.D. # 49615

BY: Jeffrey P. Fritz, Esquire

Attorney I.D. #78124

1525 Locust Street, Eighth Floor

Philadelphia, PA 19102

George Hartwell,

Erma Hartwell, Individually and as Co-Administrators of the Estate of

Zachary D. Hartwell

Melbourne, Fl 32901

Plaintiffs

V.

Barnaby's West Chester, Inc., d/b/a

Barnaby's of America

West Chester, PA 19382

and

Andrew J. Donaghy

and

Ronald Dunn, Co-Administrators of

The Estate of Ryan M. Dunn

Media, Pa. 19063

Defendants

Attorney for Plaintiff(s)

COURT OF COMMON PLEAS OF PHILADELPHIA COUNTY

TERM, 2012

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

CIVIL ACTION COMPLAINT NEGLIGENCE - 2V

1. Plaintiffs, George Hartwell and Erma Hartwell, Individually and as coadministrators of the Estate of Zachary Hartwell, Deceased are adult individuals residing at

Melbourne, Fl 32901.

2. Defendant Barnaby's West Chester, Inc., d/b/a Barnaby's of America (hereinafter "Barnabys") is a Pennsylvania Corporation conducting business and maintaining offices at 11-15

High Street, West Chester, Pa. Further, Defendant "Barnaby's" is a business engaged in the services of alcoholic beverages to the public and/or the management of liquor license establishment at *inter alia*, "Barnaby's of America".

- 3. Defendant Andrew J. Donaghy and Ronald Dunn, are co-administrators of the Estate of Ryan M. Dunn, Deceased, (Hereinafter referred to as "The Estate of Ryan Dunn") and currently do business at Media, Pa. 19063.
- 4. This action is brought against the Estate of Ryan Dunn pursuant to common law negligence and recklessness principles, as well as against Defendant Barnaby's pursuant to the laws, statutes and ordinances relating to the service of alcoholic beverages by bars, restaurants and other liquor licensees.
- 5. At all relevant times the agents, officers, servants, workers, independent contractors and/or employees of defendant Barnaby's were all acting within the course and scope of their employment and/or agency with this defendant.
- 6. At all relevant times, the defendant Barnaby's, along with their agents, servants and/or employees, had a duty to conform to the requirements of the Pennsylvania Code and statutes prohibiting the service of alcoholic beverages to intoxicated persons incapable of handling alcohol and, more importantly, persons who are visibly intoxicated.
- 7. At all relevant times, the Defendant Barnaby's and their agents, servants and/or employees had a duty to exercise reasonable and proper care in the sale, supply and furnishing and/or providing of alcoholic beverages so as to protect patrons and members of the public generally and Plaintiffs' Decedent, Zachary Hartwell, particularly, from the dangers and hazards posed by intoxicated persons including defendant, The Estate of Ryan M. Dunn, and its decedent, Ryan M. Dunn. Further, the Defendant Barnaby's had a duty not to serve beverages to any

persons who are visibly intoxicated, including Ryan M. Dunn, now deceased.

- 8. The Estate of Ryan Dunn is legally liable and responsible for the negligence, recklessness and other violations committed by Ryan Dunn, now deceased.
- 9. On June 20, 2011, at approximately 2:30 a.m., Ryan Dunn, after being served alcohol by the Liquor Licensee Defendant Barnaby's while in a visibly intoxicated state, operated a vehicle while under the influence of alcohol in violation of Pennsylvania Law.
- 10. On or about the same date and time, Plaintiffs' Decedent Zachary Hartwell was a front seat passenger in the vehicle operated by Ryan Dunn which was traveling on Route 322, also known as Pottstown Pike, in a westbound direction when he suddenly, and without warning, failed to negotiate a ramp and struck a guardrail which then caused the vehicle to be steered off the roadway and strike a tree in West Goshen Township, Chester County, Pennsylvania.
- 11. Defendants' Decedent, Ryan Dunn, was at all times herein operating the vehicle in which Plaintiffs' Decedent, Zachary Hartwell was a passenger, while in an intoxicated state, negligently and/or recklessly operating the vehicle causing it to leave the roadway.
- 12. Such intoxicated operation of the vehicle leading to the crash caused severe and fatal injuries to Plaintiffs' Decedent, Zachary Hartwell, and plaintiffs' damages are outlined below.

COUNT I - DRAM SHOP VIOLATIONS PLAINTIFFS GEORGE HARTWELL, and ERMA HARTWELL INDIVIDUALLY AND AS CO-ADMINISTRATORS OF THE ESTATE OF ZACHARY HARTWELL, DECEASED V. DEFENDANT BARNABYS WEST CHESTER INC., d/b/a BARNABYS OF AMERICA

13. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by reference the allegations set forth in paragraphs 1 through 12 above, as if same were set forth at length herein.

- 14. Upon information and belief, Defendant Barnaby's actively and systematically does business in Philadelphia County.
- 15. The negligence, carelessness, recklessness and violations of Defendant Barnaby's consisted of the following:
 - a. providing, supplying, furnishing and/or selling alcoholic beverages to a
 person who was visibly intoxicated and/or who was habitually drunk and
 of known intemperate habits;
 - b. permitting others to provide, supply, furnish, serve and/or sell alcoholic beverages to Defendants Decedent, Ryan Dunn who was visibly intoxicated;
 - providing, supplying, furnishing, serving and/or selling alcoholic beverages to Defendants' Decedent, Ryan Dunn who was visibly intoxicated;
 - d. permitting others to provide, supply, furnish, serve and /or sell alcoholic beverages to Defendants' Decedent, Ryan Dunn while he was visibly intoxicated;
 - e. negligence per se and/or strict liability for providing, supplying, furnishing, serving and/or selling alcoholic beverages to persons including Defendants' Decedent Ryan Dunn who were visibly intoxicated and/or who was habitually drunk and/or of known intemperate habits;
 - f. negligence per se and/or strict liability for violations of Pennsylvania Crime Code, Pennsylvania Liquor Code including provisions relating to the sale and supply and/or furnishing of alcoholic beverages to persons visibly intoxicated by liquor licensees, their agents, servants, and/or employees;
 - g. violations of all statutes concerning the service of alcoholic beverages giving rise to civil liability;
 - h. respondent superior or vicarious liability for acts and/or omissions of this defendant's employees, agents, servants, independent contractors, shareholders, partners and/or property owners; and
 - i. violating 47 Pa. C.S.A.§§ 4-493 and 4-497.

Case ID: 12080030

- 16. As a direct and proximate result of the Defendant Barnaby's negligence, carelessness and recklessness as described above, Plaintiffs' Decedent Zachary Hartwell was caused to sustain severe and fatal injuries, and was killed in the said motor vehicle accident.
- 17. Defendant Barnaby's conduct complained of herein was unlawful, outrageous, wanton and willful, and done within reckless disregard for the safety of Plaintiffs' Decedent Zachary Hartwell, warranting the imposition of punitive damages which are sought herein by Plaintiffs against this defendant.

WHEREFORE, plaintiffs George Hartwell and Erma Hartwell, Individually and as Co-Administrators of the Estate of Zachary Hartwell, demand judgment against Defendant Barnaby's West Chester Inc., d/b/a Barnaby's of America, jointly and severally with all other Defendants and seek punitive and compensatory damages in excess of the jurisdictional amount required for arbitration referral by local rules in Philadelphia County, together with interest, costs and delay damages as the law may allow.

COUNT II - NEGLIGENCE & RECKLESSNESS

PLAINTIFFS GEORGE HARTWELL and ERMA HARTWELL, INDIVIDUALLY AND AS CO-ADMINISTRATORS OF THE ESTATE OF ZACHARY HARTWELL, DECEASED V. DEFENDANTS ANDREW J. DONAGHY AND RONALD DUNN, CO-ADMINISTRATORS OF THE ESTATE OF RYAN M. DUNN

- 18. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by reference the allegations set forth in paragraphs 1 through 17 above, as if same were set forth at length herein.
- 19. The fatal injuries sustained by Plaintiffs' Decedent Zachary Hartwell were caused by the carelessness, negligence and recklessness of Defendants' Decedent Ryan Dunn and consisted of the following:

- failing to have his vehicle under adequate and proper control;
- b. failing to maintain his motor vehicle;
- c. failing to stop his vehicle;
- d. violently colliding his vehicle off a road and into a tree;
- e. operating said vehicle at an excessive rate of speed;
- f. operating his vehicle while under the influence of alcohol; and
- g. failing to operate said vehicle in accordance with the applicable statutes of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.
- 20. The above mentioned motor vehicle accident resulted from the negligence, carelessness, recklessness of Defendants Decedent Ryan Dunn in conjunction with the violation of the other defendant and was due in no manner whatsoever to any act or failure to act on the part of Plaintiffs' Decedent Zachary Hartwell.
- 21. As a direct and proximate result of Defendants Decedent Ryan Dunn's negligence and carelessness and recklessness, Plaintiffs' Decedent Zachary Hartwell was caused to suffer personal injuries as described more fully hereinafter and Plaintiffs' Decedent suffered severe injuries resulting in his death.
- 22. Defendants' Decedent Ryan Dunn's conduct complained of herein was outrageous, wanton, willful, and done in reckless disregard for the safety of Plaintiffs' Decedent Zachary Hartwell warranting the imposition of punitive damages which are sought by plaintiffs herein.
- 23. As a direct and proximate result of the Defendants' Decedent Ryan Dunn's outrageous, wanton, willful and reckless acts as stated above, Plaintiffs' Decedent Zachary Hartwell was caused to suffer injuries, damages and an untimely death as described above.

WHEREFORE, plaintiffs George Hartwell, Erma Hartwell and, Individually and as Co-Administrators of the Estate of Zachary Hartwell, demand judgment against Defendants Andrew J. Donaghy and Ronald Dunn, Co-Administrators of The Estate of Ryan M. Dunn, jointly and severally with the other Defendant Barnaby's West Chester, Inc., d/b/a Barnaby's of America and seek punitive and compensatory damages in excess of the jurisdictional amount required for arbitration referral by local rules in Philadelphia County, together with interest, costs and delay damages as the law may allow.

COUNT III - WRONGFUL DEATH

GEORGE HARTWELL AND ERMA HARTWELL, INDIVIDUALLY AND AS CO-ADMINISTRATORS OF THE ESTATE OF ZACHARY HARTWELL, DECEASED V. DEFENDANT BARNABYS WEST CHESTER INC., d/b/a BARNABYS OF AMERICA AND ANDREW J. DONAGHY AND RONALD DUNN, CO-ADMINISTRATORS OF THE ESTATE OF RYAN M. DUNN

- 24. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by reference the allegations set forth in paragraphs 1 through 23 above, as if same were set forth at length herein.
- 25. Plaintiffs George Hartwell and Erma Hartwell, Individually and as Co-Administrators of the Estate of Zachary Hartwell, bring this action by virtue of 42 Pa.C.S.A. §§ 8301 and 8302 Pennsylvania Rule of Civil Procedure 2202(a).
- 26. As a result of the negligence and recklessness of Defendants as described above, Plaintiffs' Decedent Zachary Hartwell was caused to sustained fatal injuries and died on June 20, 2011.
- 27. Decedent Zachary Hartwell left surviving the following persons who claim damages for his death on whose behalf this action has been brought:
 - a. George Hartwell

Melbourne, Fl 32901

b. Erma Hartwell

Melbourne, Fl 32901

c. Rachel Hartwell

Downingtown, PA 19335

28. By reason of the death of the Decedent Zachary Hartwell, the aforesaid as beneficiaries of plaintiffs George Hartwell and Erma Hartwell are entitled by law to recover damages for his wrongful death and have suffered pecuniary losses of services, guidance, society, loss of consortium, and comfort of the decedent and has incurred expenses including but not limited to administration, expenses, funeral expenses, expenses for medical services and supplies incident to the treatment of subsequent death of Zachary Hartwell for which they are entitled to compensation.

WHEREFORE, plaintiffs George Hartwell and Erma Hartwell, Individually and as Co-Administrators of the Estate of Zachary Hartwell demand judgment against Defendants Andrew J. Donaghy and Ronald Dunn, Co-Administrators of The Estate of Ryan M. Dunn, jointly and severally with the other Defendant Barnabys West Chester, Inc., d/b/a Barnaby's of America and seek punitive and compensatory damages in excess of the jurisdictional amount required for arbitration referral by local rules in Philadelphia County, together with interest, costs and delay damages as the law may allow.

COUNT IV- SURVIVAL ACTION

GEORGE HARTWELL and ERMA HARTWELL, INDIVIDUALLY AND AS CO-ADMINISTRATORS OF THE ESTATE OF ZACHARY HARTWELL, DECEASED V. DEFENDANT BARNABYS WEST CHESTER INC., d/b/a BARNABYS OF AMERICA AND ANDREW J. DONAGHY AND RONALD DUNN, CO-ADMINISTRATORS OF THE ESTATE OF RYAN M. DUNN 29. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by reference the allegations set forth in paragraphs 1 through 28 above, as if same were set forth at length herein.

30. Plaintiffs claim on behalf of the Estate of Zachary Hartwell all damages suffered by decedent, including but not limiting to the generality of the foregoing, anxiety, pre-impact fright, fear, pain and suffering, which plaintiffs' decedent experienced prior to his death, the loss of earnings, the loss of earning power, loss of wages, and other earnings which decedent would have realized during the remainder of his life expectancy.

31. Plaintiffs brings this action on behalf of the Estate of Zachary Hartwell by virtue of the Probate, Estate and Fiduciary Code, 20 Pa. C.S.A. § 3373 and 42 Pa. C.S.A. § 8302 and are entitled to recover benefits and damages available under the Pennsylvania survival statutes on behalf of said Estate by reason of the death of the decedent, as well as for the pain and suffering the decedent experienced prior to his death as well as damages for the loss of value of life and life's pleasures which have been denied and as a result of his untimely death.

WHEREFORE, plaintiffs George Hartwell and Erma Hartwell, Individually and as Co-Administrators of the Estate of Zachary Hartwell demand judgment against Defendants Andrew J. Donaghy and Ronald Dunn, Co-Administrators of The Estate of Ryan M. Dunn, jointly and severally with the other Defendant Barnaby's West Chester, Inc., d/b/a Barnaby's of America and seek punitive and compensatory damages in excess of the jurisdictional amount required for arbitration referral by local rules in Philadelphia County, together with interest, costs and delay damages as the law may allow.

Dated: 8/87/12

John W. Zervanos, Bsquire

VERIFICATION

I, Erma Hartwell, have read the foregoing Complaint. The statements contained therein are true and correct to the best of my personal knowledge, information and belief.

This statement and verification is made subject to the penalties of 18 Pa. C.S.A. Section 4904 relating to unsworn falsification to authorities, which provides that if I make knowingly false averments I may be subject to criminal penalties.

Dated: 8/2/12

Erma Hartwell, Individually and as Co-Administrator of the Estate

of Zachary Hartwell

VERIFICATION

I, George Hartwell, have read the foregoing Complaint. The statements contained therein are true and correct to the best of my personal knowledge, information and belief.

This statement and verification is made subject to the penalties of 18 Pa. C.S.A. Section 4904 relating to unsworn falsification to authorities, which provides that if I make knowingly false averments I may be subject to criminal penalties.

Dated: Que 1 12

George Hartwell, Individually and as Co-Administrator of the Estate of Zachary Hartwell